

HAA 2005  
Fall 2019

## METHODS OF THE HISTORY OF ART AND ARCHITECTURE

Tuesdays, 2:30-5:20 pm  
Frick Fine Arts Room 104

### Faculty

Josh Ellenbogen  
[jmellenb@gmail.com](mailto:jmellenb@gmail.com)

Frick 224

Office Hours: T 5:30–6:30; Th 12:30–1:30

Michelle McCoy  
[mmm245@pitt.edu](mailto:mmm245@pitt.edu)

Frick 221

T 5:30–6:30; Th 11:00–noon

### Course Description and Goals

This course aims to introduce graduate students to some of the key interpretative questions and approaches that structure art historical discussion today. Typical methods seminars proceed by engaging distinct approaches in sequence—a week on psychoanalytic approaches, a week on social history, a week on gender, et cetera. Although this approach has its advantages, it suffers from a) fragmenting the intellectual terrain of art history, so that the discipline appears to consist of separate little boxes into which art historians drop themselves as adherents, b) only providing the most cursory familiarity with the methodological approaches at issue, and c) doing very little with the treatment of actual material objects.

In an effort to avoid these pitfalls, the present course unfolds differently. First, we will address the treatment of specific works of art in a variety of ways over the course of the term, including field trips and assignments. Second, rather than attempting to provide some general survey of all the separately labeled methodologies into which the discipline gets carved up, we apply the department's Constellations model, which turns on thinking out and developing very broad intellectual frames. (For an introduction to the HAA Constellations at Pitt, how they are conceived, and how they have been engaged, please see: <https://constellations.pitt.edu/>.) Each Constellation is meant to encompass a large bulk of the discipline's guiding questions. By utilizing them, we therefore aim to make available to students a conceptual terrain in which they can situate, understand, and interrogate the different methodologies they will run across during their careers as scholars, from critical race theory to formalism. Owing to the interests and specialization of the faculty members teaching the class, two constellations will receive disproportionate attention, Agency and Visual Knowledge. Over the course of the semester, we will work to develop critical understanding of both the individual readings and these Constellations themselves. To accommodate interest in those Constellations that receive lesser focus, two weeks will be allotted near the end of the term for students to select readings and lead discussion on them (see below).

## Requirements

This seminar is a collaborative endeavor, and each student has an equal share in shaping it. We encourage and expect your avid participation. *All readings will be posted on Courseweb; there is no textbook for this course.*

## Expectations

- Regular attendance and avid participation in class discussions
- Weekly reading responses
- Two presentations: one on assigned readings, one designed as a group
- One short paper (ca. 6 to 8 pages), due midnight October 15
- One final paper (ca. 15 to 20 pages), due midnight December 10

*Reading responses:* In 250 to 500 words 1) identify what is salient about the reading(s) and 2) raise questions and/or issues for discussion. Reading responses will be evaluated on a pass/fail basis as part of your attendance and participation grade. They must be posted to the class tumblr (see below) **by midnight on the Sunday** before each session. Students are expected to read their colleagues' responses in advance of each seminar meeting. For any session during which a student is acting as discussion leader (see below), that student does not need to post a response to tumblr.

*Presentation 1 (assigned readings):* Once during the semester each student will be responsible for leading discussion. As discussion leader, your task is to do, in a more incisive and comprehensive fashion, what you are already doing in the weekly responses: generate thoughts and questions that can sustain discussion for the entire class. Discussion should open with a 15-minute presentation, likely with the aid of slides. Weekly leaders will read and respond to the questions their colleagues raise in the responses posted to tumblr (although they are of course encouraged to direct the discussion to those avenues that they deem most fruitful, regardless of what the tumblr responses contain).

*Presentation 2 (student-designed sessions):* Towards the start of the term, students will be slotted into one of two groups based on their areas of interest. Each group will select readings, topics, and lead discussion for their assigned week. This course makes no pretense to handling every methodological approach, or even all of the Constellations. For this reason, lines of inquiry in which particular students have a deep personal investment may not end up being explicitly addressed on weeks that your instructors have chosen the reading and class format. Therefore, we have allocated two weeks in which graduate students will run the class by choosing readings and creating lesson plans that can sustain discussion for an entire session. **Each group will meet separately with the instructors in advance of the presentation (see deadlines below). You should expect to have preparatory meetings amongst yourselves as many times as necessary in advance of your group presentation.**

*Short and long papers:* Detailed guidelines for the paper assignments will be given in advance.

### **Grade Breakdown**

- Class participation, presentations, weekly reading responses (25%)
- Short Paper (25%)
- Final Paper (50%)

### **Tumblr**

This course has its own private tumblr blog ([haa20052019.tumblr.com](http://haa20052019.tumblr.com)), which we will use to facilitate discussion and to archive our thinking/activities over the course of the semester. Each participant must join the tumblr. To do so, sign up for a tumblr account if you don't have one already and email the professors the email address associated with your account.

### **Writing**

For written assignments in this course, you may benefit from the following prompt, borrowed from <http://www.artswriters.org/guidelines.php>, which encourages authors to produce writing:

- that is rigorous, passionate, eloquent, and precise;
- in which a keen engagement with the present is infused with an appreciation of the historical;
- that is neither afraid to take a stand, nor content to deliver authoritative pronouncements, but serves rather to pose questions and to generate new possibilities for thinking about, seeing, and making art;
- that is sensitive to both the importance and difficulty of situating aesthetic objects within their broader social and political contexts;
- that does not dilute or sidestep complex ideas but renders accessible their meaning and value;
- that creatively challenges the limits of existing conventions without valorizing novelty as an end in itself.

\*\*\*

### **Schedule**

**8/27: Course introduction**

**9/3: Objects as Subjects**

Bredenkamp, Horst and Elizabeth Clegg. 2017. *Image Acts. A Systematic Approach to Visual Agency*. Berlin; Boston: De Gruyter.

Mitchell, W. J. T. "What Do Pictures 'Really' Want?" *October* 77 (1996): 71-82.

### **9/10: Decentering the Human**

Brown, Bill. "Thing Theory." *Critical Inquiry* 28, no. 1 (2001): 1-22.

Allen, Catherine J. "When Utensils Revolt: Mind, Matter, and Modes of Being in the Pre-Columbian Andes." *RES: Anthropology and Aesthetics*, no. 33 (1998): 18-27.

Demos, T. J. 2016. *Decolonizing Nature Contemporary Art and the Politics of Ecology*. Sternberg Press (distributed by MIT Press).

### **9/17: Inescapable Consciousness**

Bennet, Jane. 2010. *Vibrant Matter: A Political Ecology of Things*. Durham: Duke.

Toadvine, Ted. "The Elemental Past." *Research in Phenomenology* 44, no. 2 (2014): 262-79.

### **9/24: Representationality and Idolatry**

Wind, Edgar. "Warburg's Concept of *Kulturwissenschaft* and Its Meaning for Aesthetics (1931)." In Wind. 1993. *The Eloquence of Symbols: Studies in Humanist Art*. Ed. Jaynie Anderson and Hugh Lloyd-Jones. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Warburg, Aby M., and Michael P. Steinberg. *Images from the Region of the Pueblo Indians of North America*. Ithaca; London: Cornell University Press, 1995.

Snyder, Joel. 1993. "What Happens by Itself in Photography." In *The Pursuits of Reason: Essays in Honor of Stanley Cavell*. Eds. Ted Cohen, Paul Guyer, Hilary Putnam. Lubbock, TX: Texas Tech.

Bazin, André. "The Ontology of the Photographic Image." Transl. Hugh Gray. *Film Quarterly* 13, no. 4 (1960): 4-9.

### **10/1: Empathy and Affect**

Wölfflin, Heinrich. "Prolegomena to the Psychology of Architecture." In *Empathy, Form, and Space: Problems in German Aesthetics*. 1994. Santa Monica, CA [Chicago]: Getty Center for the History of Art and the Humanities, Distributed by the University of Chicago Press.

HAA 2005  
Fall 2019

Worringer, Wilhem. 1997 [1908] *Abstraction and Empathy: A Contribution to the Psychology of Style*. Trans. Michael Bullock. Chicago: Elephant Paperbacks.

### **10/8: Anarchy and Antimodernism**

Franke, Anselm and Tom Holert. 2018. *Neolithic Childhood: Art in a False Present, c. 1930*. Diaphanes, Distributed by U Chicago.

### **10/15: The World Under the Modern Gaze**

Summers, David. 2003. *Real Spaces: World Art History and the Rise of Western Modernism*. Phaidon. (selections)

Gombrich, Ernst. "Meditations on a Hobby Horse, or the Roots of Artistic Form." In Gombrich. 1963. *Meditations on a Hobby Horse and Other Essays on the Theory of Art*. Phaidon.

*\*Deadline for Group A to meet with JE & MM*

*\*Paper 1 due*

### **10/22: Subjects as Objects**

Faure, Bernard. "The Buddhist Icon and the Modern Gaze." *Critical Inquiry* 24, no. 3 (1998): 768-813.

Wang, Eugene. 2014. "The Shadow Image in the Cave: Discourse on Icons." In *Early Medieval China Sourcebook*. Ed. Wendy Swartz. Columbia University Press.

Eck, Diana L. 1998 [3<sup>rd</sup> edn.]. *Darsan: Seeing the Divine Image in India*. Columbia.

Florensky, Pavel. "Reverse Perspective." In *Beyond Vision: Essays on the Perception of Art*. Ed. Nicoletta Misler. Reaktion, 2002.

### **10/29: Games and Ruptures**

Davis, Whitney. 2009. "How Visual Culture Becomes Visible." In *A General Theory of Visual Culture*. Princeton.

Kubler, George. 1962. *The Shape of Time: Remarks on the History of Things*. New Haven, Yale.

HAA 2005  
Fall 2019

### **11/5: Art and Knowledge**

Daston, Lorraine. 2015. "Epistemic Images." In *Vision and its Instruments: Art, Science, and Technology in Early Modern Europe*. Ed. Alina Payne. College Park: Penn State Press.

Warburg, Aby. "Italian Art and International Astrology in the Palazzo Schifanoia, Ferrara," (1919) in *The Renewal of Pagan Antiquity: Contributions to the Cultural History of the European Renaissance*. Trans. David Britt. Getty Trust Publications, 1999.

Latour, Bruno. "Visualization and Cognition: Drawing Things Together." In *Knowledge and Society Studies in the Sociology of Culture Past and Present*. Ed. H. Kuklick. Jai Press.

Erwin Panofsky. "Galileo as a Critic of the Arts: Aesthetic Attitude and Scientific Thought." *Isis* 47, no. 1 (1956): 3-15.

\* *Deadline for Group B to meet with JE & MM*

### **11/12: Student-led I**

### **11/19: Surface, Image, Affect**

Hay, Jonathan. *Chinese Ink Painting: A Glossary of Terms*

\**11/22 Field trip to Cleveland Museum*

### **12/3: Student-led II**

### **12/10: Final paper due**

\*\*\*

### **University-Wide Policies & Resources**

**Academic Integrity:** Cheating or plagiarism on any exam or assignment will not be tolerated. Simply put, plagiarism is using someone else's words or ideas as if they are your own. If you ever use someone else's text, word-for-word, in your own writing, you must enclose those words in quotation marks and cite the source; if you paraphrase from a source, you must cite it as well.

If you try to pass off someone else's writing or research as your own in any exam or assignment, or otherwise cheat in the course, *you will receive a zero grade for the course and you will be reported to the dean's office for disciplinary action pursuant to the School's Academic Integrity Code* (see

<https://www.as.pitt.edu/faculty/policies-and-procedures/academic-integrity-code.>)]

If, having read the Academic Integrity Code, you have further questions about what constitutes plagiarism or other forms of academic dishonesty, please meet with the instructor or visit the campus Writing Center (<http://www.writingcenter.pitt.edu/>).

**Disability Accommodation:** If you have a disability for which you are or may be requesting an accommodation, you must contact me and the Office of Disability Resources and Services (<http://www.studentaffairs.pitt.edu/drs/welcome>), *within the first two to three weeks of the term*. DRS will verify your disability and determine reasonable accommodations for this course.

**Email Policy:** Each student is issued a University e-mail address (username@pitt.edu) upon admittance. This e-mail address will be used by the University for official communication with students. Students are expected to read e-mail sent to this account on a regular basis. Failure to read and react to University communications in a timely manner does not absolve the student from knowing and complying with the content of the communications. The University provides an e-mail forwarding service that allows students to read their email via other service providers (e.g. Gmail, Yahoo). Students who choose to forward their e-mail from their pitt.edu address to another address do so at their own risk. If e-mail is lost because of forwarding, this does not absolve the student from responding to official communications sent to their University e-mail address. To forward e-mail sent to your University account, go to <http://accounts.pitt.edu>, log into your account, click on Edit Forwarding Addresses, and follow the instructions on the page. Be sure to log out of your account when you have finished. (For the full E-mail Communication Policy, go to [www.bc.pitt.edu/policies/policy/09/09-10-01.html](http://www.bc.pitt.edu/policies/policy/09/09-10-01.html).)

**Policy on Recording Classroom Sessions:** To ensure the free and open discussion of ideas, students may not record classroom lectures, discussion and/or activities without the advance written permission of the instructor, and any such recording properly approved in advance can be used solely for the student's own private use.

**Accessing Basic Resources:** There are students at the university who struggle to access basic resources, including food and housing. The University Library System has developed a web guide to connect students to places where they can get assistance, including Pitt Pantry, emergency student loans, and assistance with book purchases. Local and regional organizations are also listed here. <https://pitt.libguides.com/c.php?g=764210&p=5481767>.