

Pitt/HAA 1025
Fall 2019

HISTORY AND ETHICS OF COLLECTING AND COLLECTIONS

Wednesdays, 6:00-8:30pm

204 Frick Fine Arts Building
Professor Shirin Fozi (aka Dr. Jones)
sfozi@pitt.edu

Office Hours: Tuesdays 11am-1pm (and by appointment)
Office: 235 Frick Fine Arts (at the top of the front stairs)
Mailbox: 104 Frick Fine Arts (HAA main office)

Course Description: This course explores the formation of public and private collections, the evolution of collecting practices, the cultural and scholarly questions and rationales behind collecting, and the legal and ethical challenges that collections face. Using a range of examples from a variety of cultural and historical focal points, we will evaluate the arguments for and against universal art museums, the repatriation of works to source nations or original owners, and the protection of cultural heritage during times of conflict.

Course Rationale and Learning Objectives: This class features a variety of formats: discussions, presentations, debates, and lectures. You will be expected to develop a nuanced and informed understanding of “cultural property” and its ethical, philosophical, and legal aspects, especially as applied to the modern museum, as well as acquiring a grasp of the history of collecting art in the Western tradition, with a focus on the intertwined issues of ownership and identity from the late Roman Empire to World War II. Students will be expected to evaluate and apply questions and critiques to the history and ethics of collecting, and to develop and defend ideas regarding the purpose, process, and ethics of museums. There are no prerequisites for this course.

Required Materials: There is no textbook for this class; all readings will be posted as .pdf files or internet links on CourseWeb under the Documents tab.

Course Expectations, Requirements, and Key Dates:

Class Participation (20%): This includes regular attendance, contributions to class discussions, and responding to classmates’ presentations throughout the semester.
Group Work (20%): Everyone will participate in two groups for class presentations. Guidelines will be posted; presentations can be informal as long as they are thoughtful.
Assignments (20%): 2-3 pages, 12pt Times New Roman, double-spaced, written in response to reading questions posted on Courseweb. You may **choose any ten** of the twelve weekly assignments to submit; Assignments 1 and 4 are required for everyone.
Individual Research Presentations (10%): These are brief, polished summaries of your Final Papers, to be presented in class and discussed on November 20 and December 4.
Final Paper (30%): 300-word abstract and annotated bibliography and due September 25; Final Paper (8-10 pages) due at 5pm on Monday, December 10.

UNIVERSITY POLICIES:

Academic Integrity

Students will be expected to comply with Pitt's Policy on Academic Integrity. Any student suspected of violating this obligation for any reason during the semester will be required to participate in the procedural process, initiated at the instructor level, as outlined in the University Guidelines on Academic Integrity. This may include, but is not limited to, the confiscation of the examination of any individual suspected of violating University Policy. Furthermore, no student may bring any unauthorized materials to an exam, including dictionaries and programmable calculators.

Late Work and Missed Exams

Late assignments will be accepted, but a half grade (A to A-, A- to B+, etc.) will be deducted from the grade for each day that the assignment is late. Exceptions can only be made if the student presents a signed letter from a medical doctor or a University administrator. Make-up exams can be scheduled but will cover different images and questions from the original exam in order to ensure a fair test for everyone.

Disability Services

If you have a disability that requires special testing accommodations or other classroom modifications, you need to notify both the instructor and Disability Resources and Services no later than the second week of the term. You may be asked to provide documentation of your disability to determine the appropriateness of accommodations.

To notify Disability Resources and Services, call (412) 648-7890 (Voice or TTD) to schedule an appointment. The Disability Resources and Services office is located in 140 William Pitt Union on the Oakland campus.

Copyright Notice

Course materials may be protected by copyright. United States copyright law, 17 USC section 101, et seq., in addition to University policy and procedures, prohibit unauthorized duplication or retransmission of course materials. See Library of Congress Copyright Office and the University Copyright Policy.

Statement on Classroom Recording

To ensure the free and open discussion of ideas, students may not record classroom lectures, discussion and/or activities without the advance written permission of the instructor, and any such recording properly approved in advance can be used solely for the student's own private use.

Information for students on accessing basic resources

There are students at Pitt who struggle to access basic resources, including food and housing. The University Library System has built a web guide to places where they can get assistance, including Pitt Pantry, emergency student loans, and assistance with book purchases. Local and regional organizations are also listed:

<https://pitt.libguides.com/c.php?g=764210&p=5481767>.

Schedule	What happens in class	What you should prepare
Week 1 Aug. 28	<i>Class discussion</i> What deserves to be preserved? What belongs in a museum? What determines value? Who gets to decide?	Reading: - Susan Stewart, <i>On Longing</i> (1984) Assignment 1 (REQUIRED): Short paper (2 pages) in response to reading questions on Courseweb, due in class on Sept. 4.
Week 2 Sept. 4	<i>Class discussion</i> How do we define collections? What is the collector's role? What is the curator's role? What do we ask of visitors?	Reading: - Esmee Quodbach, "The Formation of The Frick Collection" (2009) - Mary McWilliams, "Collecting by the Book" (2003) - Mary Jo Arnoldi, "The Ward African Collection" (1998) Assignment 2: Short paper (2 pages) in response to reading questions on Courseweb, due in class on Sept. 11.
Week 3 Sept. 11	<i>Class discussion</i> Are museums educational? If so, what do they teach? If not, what do they do? What should they do?	Reading: - Carol Duncan, <i>Civilizing Rituals: Inside Public Art Museums</i> (1995) - Robert Aldrich, "Colonial Museums in a postcolonial Europe" (2010) Assignment 3: Short paper (2 pages) in response to reading questions on Courseweb, due in class on Sept. 25.
Week 4 Sept. 18	SF traveling – NO CLASS	Reading: At least three items from your own <u>annotated bibliography</u> . Assignment 4 (REQUIRED): <u>Abstract</u> , <u>annotated bibliography</u> , and responses to <u>paper prompt questions</u> due in class on Sept. 25.

<p>Week 5 Sept. 25</p>	<p><i>Presentations & discussion</i></p> <p>Contested objects:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Parthenon Marbles - Benin Bronzes - Tasmanian Ash Bundles 	<p>Reading:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Kim Sloan, “The Enlightenment and the British Museum” (2003) - Alan Wallach, “Corcoran’s Failed National Gallery” (1996) - Mark Crinson, “National Museum, Ghana” (2001) <p>Assignment 5: Short paper (2 pages) in response to reading questions on Courseweb, due in class on Oct. 2.</p>
<p>Week 6 Oct. 2</p>	<p><i>Presentations & discussion</i></p> <p>Contested sites:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Notre Dame, Paris - Hagia Sophia - Machu Picchu 	<p>Reading:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Annabel Wharton, “Dura Europos: Contexts, subtexts” (1994) - Kamyar Abdi, “Nationalism, Politics, and Archaeology in Iran” (2001) - Itala Vivan, “What Museum for Africa?” (2014) <p>Assignment 6: Short paper (2 pages) in response to reading questions on Courseweb, due in class on Oct. 9.</p>
<p>Week 7 Oct. 9</p>	<p><i>Presentations & discussion</i></p> <p>Contested histories:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Plantations - Civil War monuments - Holocaust museums 	<p>Reading:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Roger MacGinty, “Looting in Context of Violent Conflict” (2004) - Matthew Bogdanos, “The Truth about the Iraq Museum” (2005) - Neil Brodie & Colin Renfrew, “Looting and Heritage” (2005) <p>Assignment 7: Short paper (2 pages) in response to reading questions on Courseweb, due in class on Oct. 16.</p>

<p>Week 8 Oct. 16</p>	<p><i>Class discussion</i></p> <p>Clifford's Art-Culture System</p> <p>How is this useful? How is it not?</p>	<p>Reading:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - James Clifford, "On Collecting Art and Culture" (1988) <p>Assignment 8:</p> <p>Short paper (2 pages) in response to reading questions on Courseweb, due in class on Oct. 23.</p>
<p>Week 9 Oct. 23</p>	<p><i>Class debates</i></p> <p>Who Owns the Past?</p>	<p>Reading:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - James Cuno, <i>Who Owns Antiquity?</i> (2008), selections. - Irene Winter, Review of James Cuno, (2009), 522-26. - Monica Udvardy, Linda Giles, and John Mitsanze, "The Transatlantic Trade in African Ancestors," (2003), 566-80. - Morris Fred, "Negotiating Meaning in the Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act (NAGPRA)" (1997) <p>Assignment 9:</p> <p>Short paper (2 pages) in response to reading questions on Courseweb, due in class on Oct. 30.</p>
<p>Week 10 Oct. 30</p>	<p><i>Class debates</i></p> <p>Who Owns Stolen Art?</p>	<p>Reading:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Karen Warren, "A Perspective on the Ethics and Resolution of Cultural Property Issues" (1989) - Patricia Reyhan, "Conflict of Laws in Litigation between Original Owners and Good-Faith Purchasers of Stolen Art" (2001) <p>Assignment 10:</p> <p>Short paper (2 pages) in response to reading questions on Courseweb, due in class on Nov. 6.</p>

<p>Week 11 Nov. 6</p>	<p><i>Lecture & discussion</i></p> <p>A brief history of European Collections, 300-1800</p>	<p>Reading:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Amy Remensnyder, "Legendary Treasure at Conques" (1996) - George Beech, "The Eleanor of Aquitaine Vase" (1993) - Thomas DaCosta Kaufmann, "The <i>Kunstkammer</i>" (1978) - Paul Mellon, "The National Gallery of Art" (1975) <p>Assignment 11:</p> <p>Short paper (2 pages) in response to reading questions on Courseweb, due in class on Nov. 13.</p>
<p>Week 12 Nov. 13</p>	<p><i>Lecture & discussion</i></p> <p>Collections and the new Colonialisms, 1800-2000</p>	<p>Reading:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Véronique Bragard and Stéphanie Planche, "Museum Practices and the Belgian Colonial Past" (2010) - Dipesh Chakrabarty, <i>Provincializing Europe</i> (2007) <p>Assignment 12:</p> <p>Short paper (2 pages) in response to reading questions on Courseweb, due in class on Nov. 20.</p>
<p>Week 13 Nov. 20</p>	<p>Final Presentations</p>	<p>Presentations will be no more than 5-7 minutes, with time for discussion.</p>
<p>Week 14 Nov. 27</p>	<p>Thanksgiving week</p>	<p>No class; all late assignments MUST be received by Dec. 4 for credit.</p>
<p>Week 15 Dec. 4</p>	<p>Final Presentations</p>	<p>Presentations will be no more than 5-7 minutes, with time for discussion.</p>
<p>Dec. 10</p>	<p>Final Papers DUE</p>	<p><i>Extensions will be granted if you are in touch with SF <u>before</u> the due date.</i></p>